CHORUS Forum: What Article Version Best Supports Research Integrity?

- Meagan Phelan
- Executive Director, Science Press Package





What makes a *Science* paper?

- Significantly advance scientific understanding
- Present novel and important data, syntheses or concepts
- Have broad interest to the scientific community and beyond
- High technical quality



Standards of peer review at *Science*

- Assessment by Ph.D.-level staff editors
- Consultation with external scientists on Board of Reviewing Editors
- In-depth review & evaluation by two or more experts
- *Science* accept rate: 6.4%



Types of changes to the Version of Record ("VOR")

- Editorial Expression of Concern
- Correction (a, b, c)
- Retraction
- Name change policy



How often does Science publish changes to the VOR?

	Expression of Concern	Retraction
2015	2	5
2016	2	3
2017	1	3
2018	1	
2019	2	3
2020	1	5
2021	2	
Grand Total	11	19



How does Science publicize changes to the VOR?

Notify authors & affiliated press officers before publication; they help disseminate the update

Notify 6,000+ journalists during the embargoed period

Publish changes on Science's site with clear notations



How do reporters cover changes to the VOR, like retractions?

Los Angeles Times

Study linking police violence and black infants' health is retracted f



SUBSCRIBERS ARE READING He thought it was a date. Instead, h

Review: Bryan Cranston tests the b

wer of Sail' at the Geffen Family behind Fatburger under inve

money laundering, records show

Commentary: What's less fair than

Op-Ed: The pandemic isn't over. Om navirus variant to haunt us

nature

Explore content ∨ About the journal ∨ Publish with us

Subscribe

nature > news > article

NEWS 07 December 2017

Investigation finds Swedish scientists committed scientific misconduct

Probe centered on controversial paper that claimed microplastic pollution harms fish.



What COVID-time Science authors are saying about visibility at preprint versus publication stage "We had an associated preprint and received some press interest from that, but the visibility expanded massively with publication in *Science*."

"Publishing in *Science* helped our article gain visibility within the field and gave it a stamp of approval that increased its profile substantially over the preprint. Publishing in Science also helped our work enter into policy and mainstream conversation almost immediately."



Preprints at peer review: How do they change?

 Two studies in PLOS recently suggested COVID preprints don't change much at peer review. What is the reality at Science, though?



PROFESSIONAL CAMPUS JOBS EVENTS RANKINGS STUDENT S(



Preprints 'largely unchanged' by peer review, even during Covid

Two separate studies, including one that looked at early Covid papers, suggest majority of alterations are minimal

February 2, 2022

Simon Baker

Twitter: <u>@HigherBaker</u>



